



Storm Surge Barriers to Protect New York City Against the Deluge



ASCE

Edited by

Douglas Hill, Eng.Sc.D., P.E.
Malcolm J. Bowman, Ph.D., P.E.
Jagtar S. Khinda, P.D., P.E.



COASTAL, OCEANIC,
PORTS AND RIVERS
INSTITUTE

This is a preview. [Click here to purchase the full publication.](#)

STORM SURGE BARRIERS TO PROTECT NEW YORK CITY AGAINST THE DELUGE

EDITED BY

Douglas Hill, Eng.Sci.D., P.E.
Malcolm J. Bowman, Ph.D., P.E.
Jagtar S. Khinda, P.D., P.E.

SPONSORED BY

Coasts, Oceans, Ports, and Rivers Institute of
the American Society of Civil Engineers



COASTS, OCEANS,
PORTS & RIVERS
INSTITUTE

Published by the American Society of Civil Engineers

This is a preview. [Click here to purchase the full publication.](#)

Cataloging-in-Publication Data on file with the Library of Congress.

Published by American Society of Civil Engineers
1801 Alexander Bell Drive
Reston, Virginia, 20191-4400
www.asce.org/pubs

Any statements expressed in these materials are those of the individual authors and do not necessarily represent the views of ASCE, which takes no responsibility for any statement made herein. No reference made in this publication to any specific method, product, process, or service constitutes or implies an endorsement, recommendation, or warranty thereof by ASCE. The materials are for general information only and do not represent a standard of ASCE, nor are they intended as a reference in purchase specifications, contracts, regulations, statutes, or any other legal document. ASCE makes no representation or warranty of any kind, whether express or implied, concerning the accuracy, completeness, suitability, or utility of any information, apparatus, product, or process discussed in this publication, and assumes no liability therefore. This information should not be used without first securing competent advice with respect to its suitability for any general or specific application. Anyone utilizing this information assumes all liability arising from such use, including but not limited to infringement of any patent or patents.

ASCE and American Society of Civil Engineers—Registered in U.S. Patent and Trademark Office.

Photocopies and permissions. Permission to photocopy or reproduce material from ASCE publications can be obtained by sending an e-mail to permissions@asce.org or by locating a title in ASCE's online database (<http://cedb.asce.org>) and using the "Permission to Reuse" link.

Copyright © 2013 by the American Society of Civil Engineers.
All Rights Reserved.

ISBN 978-0-7844-1252-7 (paper)

ISBN 978-0-7844-7700-7 (PDF)

ISBN 978-0-7844-7743-4 (EPUB)

Manufactured in the United States of America.

*“It is not a question of **if** a major
hurricane will strike the New York area,
but **when**...”*

—Max Mayfield, Director of the Tropical Prediction
Center/National Hurricane Center, May 24, 2006

“The worst part is that we saw it coming.”

—Lawrence Roth, Deputy Executive Director,
American Society of Civil Engineers,
Chief of Staff, Hurricane Katrina External
Review Panel, March 30, 2009

This page intentionally left blank

Contents

| | |
|--|------------|
| Preface | vii |
| 1 Introduction..... | 1 |
| <i>Douglas Hill</i> | |
| 2 The Lessons of Katrina: What Went Wrong and Why..... | 9 |
| <i>Lawrence H. Roth</i> | |
| 3 Synthetic Storm Simulation for Wind Risk Assessment | 15 |
| <i>Kerry Emanuel and Sai Ravela</i> | |
| 4 Hydrodynamic/GIS Simulation of Storm Surge Flooding in the NY/NJ Harbor System | 37 |
| <i>Nicholas B. Kim, Brian S. George, and Philip W. Simmons</i> | |
| 5 Vulnerability and Potential Losses in New York City from Coastal Flooding | 58 |
| <i>Douglas Hill</i> | |
| 6 Hydrologic Feasibility of Storm Surge Barriers | 71 |
| <i>Malcolm J. Bowman and M. Hamish Bowman</i> | |
| 7 Climate Adaptation Cost for Flood Risk Management in the Netherlands..... | 99 |
| <i>Jeroen C.J.H. Aerts and Wouter J.W. Botzen</i> | |
| 8 Regulatory Changes to a New York Harbor Storm Barrier System | 114 |
| <i>Michael Scarano</i> | |
| 9 Storm Surge Barriers: Ecological and Special Concerns..... | 122 |
| <i>R. L. Swanson, C. O'Connell, and R. E. Wilson</i> | |
| 10 Geotechnical Aspects of Three Storm Surge Barrier Sites to Protect New York City from Flooding..... | 134 |
| <i>Hugh S. Lacy, Anthony DeVito, and Athena C. De Nivo</i> | |
| 11 A Global Overview of Navigable Storm Surge Barriers: Suitable Gate Types for New York from a Dutch Perspective | 150 |
| <i>P. T. M. Dircke, T. H. G. Jongeling, and P. L. M. Jansen</i> | |
| 12 Student Designs of Storm Surge Barriers for the NYC Metropolitan Area | 170 |
| <i>A. D. Ronan</i> | |

13 **East River Storm Surge Barrier**182
 Michael J. Abrahams

14 **Verrazano Narrows Storm Surge Barrier: A Dutch Vision**191
 P. L. M. Jansen and P. T. M. Dircke

15 **Arthur Kill Storm Surge Barrier: Design Concept**207
 Lawrence J. Murphy and Thomas Schoettle

16 **NY/NJ Outer Harbor Gateway**.....218
 Dennis V. Padron and Graeme Forsyth

17 **Review Panel: Should Barriers Be Built in New York City?**250
 Douglas Hill

Index257

Preface

This report contains papers presented at a conference, *Against the Deluge: Storm Surge Barriers to Protect New York City*, held on March 30 and 31, 2009, at the Polytechnic Institute of New York University in Brooklyn, New York. The conference was convened by the Infrastructure Group of the Metropolitan Section of the American Society of Civil Engineers. It was cosponsored by the Environmental Sciences Section of the New York Academy of Sciences, and the Department of Civil Engineering, Polytechnic Institute of NYU. The proceedings consist of formal papers prepared by most of the conference speakers and, in a few cases, a summary or transcript of the spoken remarks. In addition, there are transcripts of the question-and-answer periods following many of the papers, and of a review panel held at the conclusion of the first day's session.

We wish to thank the many speakers for their considerable efforts in preparing and presenting the information contained herein. In addition, we appreciate the participation of the session chairpersons: Michael Lorcak, Michael Bobker and Rae Zimmerman. For their assistance in preparing this conference, we also thank Bernard Tuchman, Lawrence Chiarelli, and our host, F.H. Griffis.

This page intentionally left blank

Chapter 1

Introduction

Douglas Hill¹

¹ Consulting Engineer, 15 Anthony Court, Huntington, NY 11743-1327, (631) 421-5544, e-mail: dhill@ms.cc.sunysb.edu

We are here to consider the idea of storm surge barriers to protect inner New York City and nearby New Jersey from a future deluge. This might result from another hurricane striking the city. It has happened before; it will happen again. With sea level rising at an increasing rate, the barriers may be needed as well to protect the city from what are now minor surges.

The objective of the conference is to begin to develop the scientific and engineering information base needed to evaluate the barrier concept and perhaps point the way to its further development.

I start with the hypothesis that we are on a path to disaster. This hypothesis will be informed and can be examined by these proceedings, and then it can be accepted or rejected.

The Threat

In 1995, 14 years ago, the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers and other agencies published a report with maps showing the extent of flooding that would occur with hurricanes of various categories striking the metropolitan region in a worst-case scenario. These were calculated with the SLOSH model (U.S. Army Corps of Engineers et al. 1995).

Figure 1 shows downtown Manhattan. In a Category 1 hurricane, the borders of all of lower Manhattan would be under water. A Category 2 hurricane would flood the financial district. An insurance consultant has estimated that the economic consequences of a Category 2 hurricane striking New York would exceed \$200 billion. Considering that the effect of such a disruption would be felt not only in New York City but also around the world, this seems a modest estimate indeed.