# IN THE Wake OF Tacoma

Suspension Bridges and the Quest for Aerodynamic Stability

DICHARD SCOTT



# In the Wake of Tacoma

# Suspension Bridges and the Quest for Aerodynamic Stability

RICHARD SCOTT



American Society of Civil Engineers 1801 Alexander Bell Drive Reston, Virginia 20191–4400

Abstract: The spectacular 1940 collapse of the Tacoma Narrows Bridge fundamentally changed the course of suspension bridge engineering. *In the Wake of Tacoma* surveys the changes the collapse has imposed on the design of suspension bridges to the present day. It describes design trends before the collapse, the collapse itself, and subsequent investigations to determine its cause. It then examines aerodynamic and other design and construction developments and their application in suspension bridges world-wide in the six decades since the collapse. The book contains 30 photographs and six line drawings, and will appeal to anyone with an interest in bridges and engineering history.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Scott, Richard, 1956 Feb. 10-

In the wake of Tacoma : suspension bridges and the quest for aerodynamic stability / Richard Scott.

p. cm. Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 0-7844-0542-5

Suspension bridges—Design and construction—History. 2. Bridges—Aerodynamics.
Tacoma Narrows Bridge (Tacoma, Wash.)—History. I. Title.

TG400 . S38 2001 624'.5'09--dc21

#### 2001034137

Any statements expressed in these materials are those of the individual authors and do not necessarily represent the views of ASCE, which takes no responsibility for any statement made herein. No reference made in this publication to any specific method, product, process, or service constitutes or implies an endorsement, recommendation, or warranty thereof by ASCE. The materials are for general information only and do not represent a standard of ASCE, nor are they intended as a reference in purchase specifications, contracts, regulations, statutes, or any other legal document. ASCE makes no representation or warranty of any kind, whether express or implied, concerning the accuracy, completeness, suitability, or utility of any information, apparatus, product, or process discussed in this publication, and assumes no liability therefore. This information should not be used without first securing competent advice with respect to its suitability for any general or specific application. Anyone utilizing this information assumes all liability arising from such use, including but not limited to infringement of any patent or patents.

ASCE and American Society of Civil Engineers—Registered in U.S. Patent and Trademark Office.

*Photocopies:* Authorization to photocopy material for internal or personal use under circumstances not falling within the fair use provisions of the Copyright Act is granted by ASCE to libraries and other users registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transactional Reporting Service, provided that the base fee of \$8.00 per article plus \$.50 per page is paid directly to CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. The identification for ASCE Books is 0-7844-0542-5/01/ \$8.00 + \$.50 per page. Requests for special permission or bulk copying should be addressed to Permissions & Copyright Dept., ASCE.

Copyright © 2001 by the American Society of Civil Engineers. All Rights Reserved. Manufactured in the United States of America. Second printing.

To my parents, for their curiosity about the world,

and to Renée.

This page intentionally left blank

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

Forev	word		xi		
Ackn	owledgr	nents	xiii		
Introduction					
1.0	Turbulent Beginnings				
	1.1	Roots in Antiquity	1		
	1.2	Modern Beginnings in America and Europe	2		
	1.3	Maturity in America—Ellet and Roebling	7		
2.0	A New Found Confidence				
	2.1	Emerging Concepts	13		
	2.2	A Proliferation of Concepts	17		
	2.3	A Generation of Enormous Spans	22		
3.0	The <b>P</b>	late Girder Suspension Bridge			
	3.1	European Origins	29		
	3.2	Early Applications in America	31		
	3.3	Steinman and the Thousand Island and Deer Isle bridges	33		
	3.4	Ammann's Bronx-Whitestone Bridge	37		
4.0	Epiph	any at the Tacoma Narrows			
	4.1	The Rise and Fall of the Tacoma Narrows Bridge	41		
	4.2	The Aftermath of the Collapse	53		
	4.3	Reminders of History	55		
	4.4	Back to the Future	58		
	4.5	The Autopsy Results	63		
	4.6	The Carmody Board and the Dynamic Role of Wind	67		
5.0	A Difficult Rebirth				
	5.1	The Insurance Battles, Replacing Gertie, the Dismantling	71		
	5.2	A Litany of Theories—the Cable Truss and Others	73		
	5.3	The Advisory Board on the Investigation of	77		
		Suspension Bridges			
	5.4	Steinman Rebuts and the Development of Stiffness Indexes	82		
	5.5	Aerodynamic Phenomena and Suspension Bridges	89		

V

6.0	Retrenchment in America				
	6.1	War-Related Spans	95		
	6.2	The Rebirth of the Tacoma Narrows Bridge	98		
	6.3	Other Early Post-Tacoma Efforts	103		
7.0	The Legacies of Two Giants				
	7.1	Steinman's Triumph at Mackinac	109		
	7.2	Steinman's Closure-the St. Lawrence and Elsewhere	117		
	7.3	Prelude to the Verrazano-Narrows-the Walt Whitman	119		
		and Throgs Neck bridges			
	7.4	Ammann's Final Legacy—the Verrazano-Narrows	122		
8.0	<b>European Reconstruction and Revolution</b>				
	8.1	The Continent Rebuilds	131		
	8.2	Great Britain Stirs	139		
	8.3	C	145		
	8.4	Revolution Across the River Severn	149		
9.0	A Re	naissance of Ideas			
	9.1	Fritz Leonhardt and the Monocable Suspension Bridge	159		
	9.2	Prestressed Concrete Suspension Bridges and Cable Trusses	163		
	9.3	Pipeline Suspension Bridges and other	165		
	2.02	Imaginative Concepts			
	9.4	Bridge across the Tagus—Innovation in Convention	170		
10.0	The Twilight of American Dominance				
	10.1	Return to the West Coast	179		
	10.2	The Rise of Prefabricated Parallel Wire Cables	184		
	10.3	Canadian Developments	190		
	10.4	American Twilight	195		
11.0	The l	Box Girder Comes of Age			
	11.1	The Lillebælt Bridge, Denmark	201		
	11.2	Spanning the Bosporus at Istanbul, Turkey	206		
	11.3	The Humber Bridge, England	212		
12.0	The Box Girder—Problems, Politics, and Pseudo-Boxes				
	12.1	Severn Under Siege	221		
	12.2	Intrigue across the Bosporus	226		
	12.3	Hong Kong's Box-like truss—the Tsing Ma Bridge	234		
13.0	The Scandinavian Experience				
	13.1	A Unique Norwegian Legacy	243		
	13.2	The Storebælt East Bridge, Denmark	250		
	13.3	Höga Kusten Bridge, Sweden	262		

14.0	Japan's Remarkable Evolution			
	14.1	Early Beginnings	267	
	14.2	Crossing the Threshold—the Kanmon and Others	270	
	14.3	Linking Honshu and Shikoku	273	
	14.4	The Seto Ohashi	280	
	14.5	The Akashi Kaikyo Bridge—A Giant Reborn	287	
	14.6	The Kurushima Triumvirate	294	
	14.7	Beyond Honshu and Shikoku	297	
15.0	China's Meteoric Rise			
	15.1	A Second Revolution	303	
16.0	New Bridges—The Near Future			
	16.1	Spans on the Cusp	311	
	16.2	The Allure of the Messina Strait	322	
17.0	Ultralong-Span Suspension Bridges and Aerodynamic Stability			
	17.1	•	334	
	17.2	A Plethora of Fantastic Schemes	339	
18.0	The Legacy of the Tacoma Narrows Bridge			
	18.1	6	345	
	18.2	The Problematic Plate Girder	351	
	18.3	The Legacy of the Tacoma Narrows Bridge	356	
Refer	References			
Biblic	Bibliography			
Appendix			375	
Index				

This page intentionally left blank

## **LIST OF FIGURES**

2-1.	George Washington Bridge	22
2-2.	Golden Gate Bridge, construction of the initial	27
	truss configuration	
3-1.	Bronx-Whitestone Bridge, in its original configuration	38
4-1.	Tacoma Narrows Bridge, 1940	46
4-2.	Torsional oscillation, Tacoma Narrows Bridge	50
4-3.	Collapse of main span, Tacoma Narrows Bridge	52
6-1.	Tacoma Narrows Bridge, 1950	99
6-2.	Comparison, first and second Tacoma Narrows bridges	100
7-1.	Mackinac Bridge	114
<b>7-</b> 2.	Evolution of post-Tacoma Narrows Bridge truss design	116
7-3.	Verrazano-Narrows Bridge	127
8-1.	Forth Road Bridge	146
8-2.	Severn Bridge	150
8-3.	Evolution of box girder suspended structures	152
9-1.	Emmerich Bridge	162
9-2.	The Tagus (25th of April) Bridge	173
10-1.	Delaware Memorial twin bridges	185
10-2.	A. Murray MacKay Bridge	191
10-3.	William Preston Lane, Jr. Memorial Bridge	196
11-1.	Lillebælt Bridge	202
11-2.	Bosporus Bridge: opening-day crowds in October 1973	213
11-3.	Humber Bridge	219
12-1.	Fatih Sultan Mehmet Bridge (the second Bosporus Bridge)	232
12-2.	Tsing Ma Bridge	241
13-1.	Askøy Bridge	248
13-2.	East Bridge, Denmark	255
13-3.	Suspension bridge towers	258
13-4.	Höga Kusten Bridge	263
14-1.	Shimotsui Seto Bridge	281
14-2.	Kita and Minami Bisan Seto bridges	285
14-3.	Akashi Kaikyo Bridge	293
14-4.	The three Kurushima bridges	295
15-1.	Jiangyin Bridge	308
16-1.	Proposed Messina Strait Bridge	328
17-1.	Growth in suspended span length	333
18-1.	Torsional excitation mechanism-Tacoma Narrows Bridge	353