ASCE Manuals and Reports on Engineering Practice No. 81

Second Edition

Guidelines for Cloud Seeding *to* Augment Precipitation

ASCE

EWRI

ASCE Manuals and Reports on Engineering Practice No. 81

Guidelines for Cloud Seeding to Augment Precipitation

Second Edition

Submitted by
the Standards Committee on Atmospheric Water Management (AWM) to the Standards Development Council (SDC) of the Environmental and Water Resources Institute (EWRI) of the American Society of Civil Engineers (ASCE)

Completed by
Revision of ASCE Manual No. 81 Subcommittee Editors: Conrad G. Keyes, Jr. (Chief Editor); Co-Editors: Bruce A. Boe, George W. Bomar, Robert R. Czys, Thomas P. DeFelice, and Don A. Griffith

ASCE **Published by the American Society of Civil Engineers**

Environmental & Water Resources Institute of the American Society of Civil Engineers EWRI

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Guidelines for cloud seeding to augment precipitation.—2nd ed. / completed by . . . subcommittee editors, Conrad G. Keyes, Jr., . . . [et al.].
p. cm. —(ASCE manuals and reports on engineering practice; no. 81)
Includes bibliographical references.
ISBN 0-7844-0819-X
1. Rain-making—United States—Handbooks, manuals, etc. 2. Precipitation (Meteorology)—Modification—United States—Handbooks, manuals, etc. I. Keyes, Conrad G. II. American Society of Civil Engineers. III. Series.

QC928.7.G85 2006
551.68'76—dc22

2005029297

Published by American Society of Civil Engineers
1801 Alexander Bell Drive
Reston, Virginia 20191
www.pubs.asce.org

ISBN 07844-0819-X
Manufactured in the United States of America.

MANUALS AND REPORTS ON ENGINEERING PRACTICE

(As developed by the ASCE Technical Procedures Committee, July 1930, and revised March 1935, February 1962, and April 1982)

A manual or report in this series consists of an orderly presentation of facts on a particular subject, supplemented by an analysis of limitations and applications of these facts. It contains information useful to the average engineer in his everyday work, rather than the findings that may be useful only occasionally or rarely. It is not in any sense a "standard," however; nor is it so elementary or so conclusive as to provide a "rule of thumb" for nonengineers.

Furthermore, material in this series, in distinction from a paper (which expressed only one person's observations or opinions), is the work of a committee or group selected to assemble and express information on a specific topic. As often as practicable the committee is under the direction of one or more of the Technical Divisions and Councils, and the product evolved has been subjected to review by the Executive Committee of the Division or Council. As a step in the process of this review, proposed manuscripts are often brought before the members of the Technical Divisions and Councils for comment, which may serve as the basis for improvement. When published, each work shows the names of the committees by which it was compiled and indicates clearly the several processes through which it has passed in review, in order that its merit may be definitely understood.

In February 1962 (and revised in April 1982) the Board of Direction voted to establish:

A series entitled "Manuals and Reports on Engineering Practice," to include the Manuals published and authorized to date, future Manuals of Professional Practice, and Reports on Engineering Practice. All such Manual or Report material of the Society would have been refereed in a manner approved by the Board Committee on Publications and would be bound, with applicable discussion, in books similar to past Manuals. Numbering would be consecutive and would be a continuation of present Manual numbers. In some cases of reports of joint committees, bypassing of Journal publications may be authorized.

MANUALS AND REPORTS ON ENGINEERING PRACTICE

No.	Title
13	Filtering Materials for Sewage Treatment Plants
14	Accommodation of Utility Plant Within the Rights-of-Way of Urban Streets and Highways
35	A List of Translations of Foreign Literature on Hydraulics
40	Ground Water Management
41	Plastic Design in Steel: A Guide and Commentary
45	Consulting Engineering: A Guide for the Engagement of Engineering Services
46	Pipeline Route Selection for Rural and Cross-Country Pipelines
47	Selected Abstracts on Structural Applications of Plastics
49	Urban Planning Guide
50	Planning and Design Guidelines for Small Craft Harbors
51	Survey of Current Structural Research
52	Guide for the Design of Steel Transmission Towers
53	Criteria for Maintenance of Multilane Highways
54	Sedimentation Engineering
55	Guide to Employment Conditions for Civil Engineers
57	Management, Operation and Maintenance of Irrigation and Drainage Systems
59	Computer Pricing Practices
60	Gravity Sanitary Sewer Design and Construction
62	Existing Sewer Evaluation and Rehabilitation
63	Structural Plastics Design Manual
64	Manual on Engineering Surveying
65	Construction Cost Control
66	Structural Plastics Selection Manual
67	Wind Tunnel Studies of Buildings and Structures
68	Aeration: A Wastewater Treatment Process
69	Sulfide in Wastewater Collection and Treatment Systems
70	Evapotranspiration and Irrigation Water Requirements
71	Agricultural Salinity Assessment and Management
72	Design of Steel Transmission Pole Structures
73	Quality in the Constructed Project: A Guide for Owners, Designers, and Constructors
74	Guidelines for Electrical Transmission Line Structural Loading
76	Design of Municipal Wastewater Treatment Plants
77	Design and Construction of Urban Stormwater Management Systems
78	Structural Fire Protection
79	Steel Penstocks
80	Ship Channel Design
81	Guidelines for Cloud Seeding to Augment Precipitation
82	Odor Control in Wastewater Treatment Plants
83	Environmental Site Investigation
84	Mechanical Connections in Wood Structures
85	Quality of Ground Water
86	Operation and Maintenance of Ground Water Facilities
87	Urban Runoff Quality Manual
88	Management of Water Treatment Plant Residuals
89	Pipeline Crossings
90	Guide to Structural Optimization
91	Design of Guyed Electrical Transmission Structures
92	Manhole Inspection and Rehabilitation
93	Crane Safety on Construction Sites
94	Inland Navigation: Locks, Dams, and Channels
95	Urban Subsurface Drainage
96	Guide to Improved Earthquake Performance of Electric Power Systems
97	Hydraulic Modeling: Concepts and Practice
98	Conveyance of Residuals from Water and Wastewater Treatment
99	Environmental Site Characterization and Remediation Design Guidance
100	Groundwater Contamination by Organic Pollutants: Analysis and Remediation
101	Underwater Investigations
103	Guide to Hiring and Retaining Great Civil Engineers
104	Recommended Practice for Fiber-Reinforced Polymer Products for Overhead Utility Line Structures
105	Animal Waste Containment in Lagoons
106	Horizontal Auger Boring Projects
107	Ship Channel Design and Operation
108	Pipeline Design for Installation by Horizontal Directional Drilling
109	Biologic Nutrient Removal Operation in Wastewater Treatment Plants

CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES ..... **x**

LIST OF FIGURES ..... **xi**

FOREWORD ..... **xii**

DEDICATION ..... **xiv**

SECTION 1—EXECUTIVE SUMMARY **1**

1.1 INTRODUCTION 1
1.2 WHY SEED CLOUDS? 2
1.3 APPROACHES AND RESTRICTIONS TO SEEDING CLOUDS 3
1.4 SCIENTIFIC BASIS FOR CLOUD SEEDING 4
1.5 THE CONDUCT OF CLOUD SEEDING OPERATIONS 5
1.6 HOW TO INITIATE A CLOUD SEEDING PROJECT 7
1.7 CONCLUSIONS 7
1.8 REFERENCES 8

SECTION 2—SOCIETAL, ENVIRONMENTAL, AND ECONOMIC ASPECTS OF PRECIPITATION ENHANCEMENT BY CLOUD SEEDING **9**

2.1 INTRODUCTION 9
2.2 SOCIETAL ASPECTS 9
2.2.1 Studies 10
2.2.2 The Diffusion of Innovations and Cloud Seeding 10
2.2.3 Assessing Public Attitudes 11
2.2.4 Assessing Community Dynamics 13
2.2.5 Decision Processes 15
2.2.6 Public Participation Procedures 17
2.3 ENVIRONMENTAL ASPECTS 18
2.3.1 Historical Perspective 18
2.3.2 The Concept of Cumulative Effects 21
2.3.3 Case Study–The Sierra Ecology Project 22
2.3.4 Case Study–Environmental Impact Statement for a Prototype Project 23

2.4 ECONOMIC ASPECTS 25
2.4.1 Deciding the Goal and Scale of Economic Analysis 26
2.4.2 Economic Aspects of Summer Cloud Seeding 27
2.4.2.1 High Plains 27
2.4.2.2 Midwestern United States 28
2.4.3 Economic Aspects of Winter Cloud Seeding 31
2.4.3.1 Arizona and Nevada 32
2.4.3.2 Utah 33
2.4.3.3 California 34
2.4.3.4 Colorado 34
2.5 CONCLUSIONS 36
2.6 REFERENCES 37

SECTION 3—LEGAL ASPECTS OF WEATHER MODIFICATION OPERATIONS 43

3.1 INTRODUCTION 43
3.2 PRE-OPERATIONAL PLANNING 44
3.2.1 Role of Regulatory Entities in the States 44
3.2.2 Weather Modification Licenses 45
3.2.2.1 A Basis for Occupational Competency 45
3.2.2.2 Initiating the Process for Obtaining a License . . . 45
3.2.3 Weather Modification Permits 46
3.2.3.1 Criteria Considered during the Permit Process . . 46
3.2.3.2 Site and Time Specificity 48
3.2.3.3 Historical Overview of Permitting Controversies 49
3.2.4 Impacts of Environmental Laws and Rules 49
3.2.4.1 Adherence to Environmental Constraints 49
3.2.4.2 Considerations for Environmental Impact Statement 50
3.2.5 Contractual Agreements among Sponsors and Operators 51
3.2.5.1 Perspectives of Sponsors and Operators 51
3.2.5.2 Ethical Standards Relating to Expectations and Claims 52
3.3 CONDUCTING OPERATIONS 52
3.3.1 Operational Control 52
3.3.2 Archival of Data and Information 53
3.3.3 Reporting Procedures 53
3.4 EVALUATING OPERATIONS 54
3.4.1 Legal Liabilities for Sponsors and Operators 54
3.4.1.1 Liability Theories 55
3.4.1.2 Causation 56
3.4.1.3 Defenses 56
3.4.1.4 Indemnity and Insurance 57

3.4.2 Water Rights 57
3.4.2.1 Atmospheric Water 58
3.4.2.2 Augmented Surface Water 58
3.5 CONCLUSIONS 59
3.6 REFERENCES 59

SECTION 4—THE SCIENTIFIC BASIS 61

4.1 INTRODUCTION 61
4.2 THE NATURAL PRODUCTION OF RAIN 62
4.2.1 Formation of Cloud Condensate 62
4.2.2 Cloud Initiation and Colloidal Stability 63
4.2.3 Initiation and Evolution of Precipitation 64
4.3 CLOUD SEEDING TO AUGUMENT RAINFALL 66
4.3.1 Seeding to Enhance the Warm Cloud Process (Hygroscopic Seeding) 66
4.3.2 Seeding to Enhance the Cold Cloud Process (Glaciogenic Seeding) 67
4.3.3 Seeding to Enhance Development of Individual Convective Clouds 69
4.3.4 Expansion of Glaciogenic Seeding Concepts to Larger Scales 70
4.4 THE NATURAL PRODUCTION OF SNOWFALL 71
4.4.1 Formation of Cloud Condensate 71
4.4.2 Cloud Initiation, Colloidal Stability, and Evolution of Precipitation 71
4.5 CLOUD SEEDING TO AUGMENT SNOWFALL 72
4.5.1 Snow Augmentation Methods 72
4.5.2 Expansion of Snow Augmentation Concepts to Larger Scales 73
4.6 TECHNOLOGICAL ADVANCES 74
4.7 CONCLUSIONS 76
4.8 REFERENCES 76

SECTION 5—CLOUD SEEDING MODES, INSTRUMENTATION, AND STATUS OF PRECIPITATION ENHANCEMENT TECHNOLOGY 81

5.1 INTRODUCTION 81
5.2 CLOUD SEEDING MODES 81
5.2.1 Cloud Seeding Agents 82
5.2.1.1 Homogeneous Nucleating Agents 83
5.2.1.2 Heterogeneous Cloud Seeding Agents 83
5.2.1.3 Organic Cloud Seeding Materials 86

5.2.1.4 Hygroscopic Materials 86
5.2.1.5 Other Seeding Methods and Inadvertent Weather Modification 87
5.2.2 Delivery Systems 88
5.2.2.1 Aerial Application 88
5.2.2.2 Ground Application 92
5.2.2.3 Advantages and Disadvantages of Aerial and Ground Systems 95
5.2.3 Deployment of Cloud Seeding Systems 98
5.2.3.1 Dispersion of Cloud Seeding Materials in Winter and Summer Clouds 98
5.2.3.2 Aerial Cloud Seeding Modes 99
5.2.3.3 Ground-Based Cloud Seeding Modes 100
5.2.3.4 Possible Studies Related to Proper Targeting of Seeding Materials 101
5.3 INSTRUMENTATION 103
5.3.1 Real-Time Decision Making and Monitoring Instrumentation 104
5.3.1.1 Available National Weather Service Data 104
5.3.1.2 Special Project Precipitation Gauges 106
5.3.1.3 Special Project Weather Radar 108
5.3.1.4 Special Project Rawinsondes 109
5.3.1.5 Supercooled Liquid Water Observations 111
5.3.1.6 Special Project Cloud Physics Instrumentation . . 112
5.3.1.7 Other Instrumentation and Equipment 113
5.3.2 Measurements of Potential Value in Post-project Assessments 114
5.3.2.1 Precipitation Gauge Data 116
5.3.2.2 Remote Sensor Data 116
5.3.2.3 Cloud Physics Data 117
5.3.2.4 Streamflow Data 118
5.3.2.5 Snow Course Data 118
5.3.2.6 Snow Sample Data 118
5.4 STATUS OF PRECIPITATION ENHANCEMENT TECHNOLOGY 119
5.4.1 American Society of Civil Engineers 120
5.4.2 Weather Modification Association 120
5.4.3 American Meteorological Society 122
5.4.4 World Meteorological Organization 124
5.5 CONCLUSIONS 127
5.6 REFERENCES 128

SECTION 6—HOW TO IMPLEMENT A CLOUD SEEDING PROGRAM 135

6.1 INTRODUCTION 135
6.1.1 Initial Program Assessment (Feasibility Study) 136
6.1.2 The Factors Governing Implementation 136
6.2 NEEDS AND GOALS 138
6.2.1 Origin of Need and Program Justification (Program Sponsors) 138
6.2.2 Political and/or Institutional Mechanisms 139
6.3 THE FEASIBILITY STUDY 139
6.3.1 Scientific Basis 139
6.3.2 Feasibility Study Objectives (Program Scope) 140
6.3.3 Statement of Program Expectations (Likelihood of Success) 145
6.4 PROGRAM DEFINITION 146
6.4.1 Seeding Modes and Agents (Design) 146
6.4.2 The Evaluation Plan 147
6.4.3 Quantification of Findings 152
6.5 PROGRAM CONTROL 154
6.5.1 Seeding Decisions 155
6.5.2 Data Collection and Access 156
6.5.3 Seeding Suspension Criteria 157
6.5.3.1 Warm Season Suspension Criteria 157
6.5.3.2 Cold Season Suspension Criteria 159
6.6 PROGRAM MANAGEMENT 160
6.7 REFERENCES 162

GLOSSARY 165

INDEX 177