# IEEE Recommended Practice for Seismic Design of Substations

**IEEE** Power and Energy Society

Sponsored by the Substation Design Criteria Committee

IEEE 3 Park Avenue New York, NY 10016-5997 USA

IEEE Std 693™-2018 (Revision of IEEE Std 693-2005)

# IEEE Recommended Practice for Seismic Design of Substations

Sponsor

Substation Design Criteria Committee of the IEEE Power and Energy Society

Approved 23 October 2018

**IEEE-SA Standards Board** 

**Abstract:** Seismic design recommendations for substations, including qualification of different equipment types are discussed. Design recommendations consist of seismic criteria, qualification methods and levels, structural capacities, performance requirements for equipment operation, installation methods, and documentation.

**Keywords:** anchorage, conductor, electrical equipment, damping, dynamic analysis, IEEE 693<sup>™</sup>, loads, projected performance, required response spectrum, seismic protective devices, seismic qualification, shake table, static coefficient analysis, support structure, suspended equipment, time history

PDF: ISBN 978-1-5044-5486-5 STD23514 Print: ISBN 978-1-5044-5487-2 STDPD23514

IEEE prohibits discrimination, harassment, and bullying.

For more information, visit <u>http://www.ieee.org/web/aboutus/whatis/policies/p9-26.html</u>.

No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form, in an electronic retrieval system or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the publisher.

The Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Inc. 3 Park Avenue, New York, NY 10016-5997, USA

Copyright © 2019 by The Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Inc. All rights reserved. Published 10 April 2019. Printed in the United States of America.

IEEE is a registered trademark in the U.S. Patent & Trademark Office, owned by The Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Incorporated.

## Important Notices and Disclaimers Concerning IEEE Standards Documents

IEEE documents are made available for use subject to important notices and legal disclaimers. These notices and disclaimers, or a reference to this page, appear in all standards and may be found under the heading "Important Notice" or "Important Notices and Disclaimers Concerning IEEE Standards Documents."

# Notice and Disclaimer of Liability Concerning the Use of IEEE Standards Documents

IEEE Standards documents (standards, recommended practices, and guides), both full-use and trial-use, are developed within IEEE Societies and the Standards Coordinating Committees of the IEEE Standards Association ("IEEE-SA") Standards Board. IEEE ("the Institute") develops its standards through a consensus development process, approved by the American National Standards Institute ("ANSI"), which brings together volunteers representing varied viewpoints and interests to achieve the final product. Volunteers are not necessarily members of the Institute and participate without compensation from IEEE. While IEEE administers the process and establishes rules to promote fairness in the consensus development process, IEEE does not independently evaluate, test, or verify the accuracy of any of the information or the soundness of any judgments contained in its standards.

IEEE does not warrant or represent the accuracy or content of the material contained in its standards, and expressly disclaims all warranties (express, implied and statutory) not included in this or any other document relating to the standard, including, but not limited to, the warranties of: merchantability; fitness for a particular purpose; non-infringement; and quality, accuracy, effectiveness, currency, or completeness of material. In addition, IEEE disclaims any and all conditions relating to: results; and workmanlike effort. IEEE standards documents are supplied "AS IS" and "WITH ALL FAULTS."

Use of an IEEE standard is wholly voluntary. The existence of an IEEE standard does not imply that there are no other ways to produce, test, measure, purchase, market, or provide other goods and services related to the scope of the IEEE standard. Furthermore, the viewpoint expressed at the time a standard is approved and issued is subject to change brought about through developments in the state of the art and comments received from users of the standard.

In publishing and making its standards available, IEEE is not suggesting or rendering professional or other services for, or on behalf of, any person or entity nor is IEEE undertaking to perform any duty owed by any other person or entity to another. Any person utilizing any IEEE Standards document, should rely upon his or her own independent judgment in the exercise of reasonable care in any given circumstances or, as appropriate, seek the advice of a competent professional in determining the appropriateness of a given IEEE standard.

IN NO EVENT SHALL IEEE BE LIABLE FOR ANY DIRECT, INDIRECT, INCIDENTAL, SPECIAL, EXEMPLARY, OR CONSEQUENTIAL DAMAGES (INCLUDING, BUT NOT LIMITED TO: PROCUREMENT OF SUBSTITUTE GOODS OR SERVICES; LOSS OF USE, DATA, OR PROFITS; OR BUSINESS INTERRUPTION) HOWEVER CAUSED AND ON ANY THEORY OF LIABILITY, WHETHER IN CONTRACT, STRICT LIABILITY, OR TORT (INCLUDING NEGLIGENCE OR OTHERWISE) ARISING IN ANY WAY OUT OF THE PUBLICATION, USE OF, OR RELIANCE UPON ANY STANDARD, EVEN IF ADVISED OF THE POSSIBILITY OF SUCH DAMAGE AND REGARDLESS OF WHETHER SUCH DAMAGE WAS FORESEEABLE.

## Translations

The IEEE consensus development process involves the review of documents in English only. In the event that an IEEE standard is translated, only the English version published by IEEE should be considered the approved IEEE standard.

# **Official statements**

A statement, written or oral, that is not processed in accordance with the IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual shall not be considered or inferred to be the official position of IEEE or any of its committees and shall not be considered to be, or be relied upon as, a formal position of IEEE. At lectures, symposia, seminars, or educational courses, an individual presenting information on IEEE standards shall make it clear that his or her views should be considered the personal views of that individual rather than the formal position of IEEE.

# **Comments on standards**

Comments for revision of IEEE Standards documents are welcome from any interested party, regardless of membership affiliation with IEEE. However, IEEE does not provide consulting information or advice pertaining to IEEE Standards documents. Suggestions for changes in documents should be in the form of a proposed change of text, together with appropriate supporting comments. Since IEEE standards represent a consensus of concerned interests, it is important that any responses to comments and questions also receive the concurrence of a balance of interests. For this reason, IEEE and the members of its societies and Standards Coordinating Committees are not able to provide an instant response to comments or questions except in those cases where the matter has previously been addressed. For the same reason, IEEE does not respond to interpretation requests. Any person who would like to participate in revisions to an IEEE standard is welcome to join the relevant IEEE working group.

Comments on standards should be submitted to the following address:

Secretary, IEEE-SA Standards Board 445 Hoes Lane Piscataway, NJ 08854 USA

# Laws and regulations

Users of IEEE Standards documents should consult all applicable laws and regulations. Compliance with the provisions of any IEEE Standards document does not imply compliance to any applicable regulatory requirements. Implementers of the standard are responsible for observing or referring to the applicable regulatory regulatory requirements. IEEE does not, by the publication of its standards, intend to urge action that is not in compliance with applicable laws, and these documents may not be construed as doing so

# Copyrights

IEEE draft and approved standards are copyrighted by IEEE under U.S. and international copyright laws. They are made available by IEEE and are adopted for a wide variety of both public and private uses. These include both use, by reference, in laws and regulations, and use in private self-regulation, standardization, and the promotion of engineering practices and methods. By making these documents available for use and adoption by public authorities and private users, IEEE does not waive any rights in copyright to the documents.

# Photocopies

Subject to payment of the appropriate fee, IEEE will grant users a limited, non-exclusive license to photocopy portions of any individual standard for company or organizational internal use or individual, non-commercial use only. To arrange for payment of licensing fees, please contact Copyright Clearance Center, Customer Service, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923 USA; +1 978 750 8400. Permission to photocopy portions of any individual standard for educational classroom use can also be obtained through the Copyright Clearance Center.

# Updating of IEEE Standards documents

Users of IEEE Standards documents should be aware that these documents may be superseded at any time by the issuance of new editions or may be amended from time to time through the issuance of amendments, corrigenda, or errata. An official IEEE document at any point in time consists of the current edition of the document together with any amendments, corrigenda, or errata then in effect.

Every IEEE standard is subjected to review at least every ten years. When a document is more than ten years old and has not undergone a revision process, it is reasonable to conclude that its contents, although still of some value, do not wholly reflect the present state of the art. Users are cautioned to check to determine that they have the latest edition of any IEEE standard.

In order to determine whether a given document is the current edition and whether it has been amended through the issuance of amendments, corrigenda, or errata, visit the IEEE-SA Website at <a href="http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpl/standards.jsp">http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpl/standards.jsp</a> or contact IEEE at the address listed previously. For more information about the IEEE-SA or IEEE's standards development process, visit the IEEE-SA Website at <a href="http://standards.jsp">http://standards.jsp</a> or contact IEEE at the address listed previously. For more information about the IEEE-SA or IEEE's standards development process, visit the IEEE-SA Website at <a href="http://standards.jsp">http://standards.jsp</a> or contact IEEE at the address listed previously. For more information about the IEEE-SA or IEEE's standards development process, visit the IEEE-SA Website at <a href="http://standards.jsp">http://standards.jsp</a> or contact IEEE at the address listed previously.

# Errata

Errata, if any, for all IEEE standards can be accessed on the IEEE-SA Website at the following URL: <u>http://standards.ieee.org/findstds/errata/index.html</u>. Users are encouraged to check this URL for errata periodically.

# Patents

Attention is called to the possibility that implementation of this standard may require use of subject matter covered by patent rights. By publication of this standard, no position is taken by the IEEE with respect to the existence or validity of any patent rights in connection therewith. If a patent holder or patent applicant has filed a statement of assurance via an Accepted Letter of Assurance, then the statement is listed on the IEEE-SA Website at <a href="http://standards.ieee.org/about/sasb/patcom/patents.html">http://standards.ieee.org/about/sasb/patcom/patents.html</a>. Letters of Assurance may indicate whether the Submitter is willing or unwilling to grant licenses under patent rights without compensation or under reasonable rates, with reasonable terms and conditions that are demonstrably free of any unfair discrimination to applicants desiring to obtain such licenses.

Essential Patent Claims may exist for which a Letter of Assurance has not been received. The IEEE is not responsible for identifying Essential Patent Claims for which a license may be required, for conducting inquiries into the legal validity or scope of Patents Claims, or determining whether any licensing terms or conditions provided in connection with submission of a Letter of Assurance, if any, or in any licensing agreements are reasonable or non-discriminatory. Users of this standard are expressly advised that determination of the validity of any patent rights, and the risk of infringement of such rights, is entirely their own responsibility. Further information may be obtained from the IEEE Standards Association

#### Participants

At the time this IEEE recommended practice was completed, the Seismic Design of Substation Working Group had the following membership:

Michael Riley, Chair Leon Kempner, Jr., Co-Vice Chair Craig Riker, Co-Vice Chair Brian Knight, Secretary

Ian Aiken J. R. Antenucci Juan Arias-Acosta Ramani Ayakannu Arash Beikayee Cameron Black Frank Blalock Matthew Brien Terry Burley Vincent Chui Robert Cochran Jean-Bernard Dastous Huan Dinh Lonnie Elder Sohrab Esfandiari Ryan Freeman Rulon Fronk Eric Fujisaki Amir Gilani Adelana Gilpin-Jackson Vincente Guerrero

William Gundy Mohammad Hariri Tan (Kevin) Hoang Philip Hoby Carl Horvath Riyad Kechroud Kamran Khan Eric Kress Benton Lott Kaolyn Mannino Kent Martin Majid Mashinchi Andrew McNulty Kelly Merz Sinni Miletic Philip Mo Neil Moore Seiichi Murase Pedro Zazueta Ordonez Jean-Robert Pierre

Perumal Radhakrishnan James Reid Carl Reigart Andrew Renton Luis Eduardo Perez Rocha Wolfgang Saad Anshel Schiff Jerrold Schreiber John Scoggins Travis Soppe Gerald Stewart Calvin Szeto Shakhzod Takhirov Janos Toth Christophe Tudo-Bornarel Ross Twidwell Achim von Seck Derrick Watkins Eric Weatherbee Oiang Xie Yaowu Zhang

The following members of the individual balloting committee voted on this recommended practice. Balloters may have voted for approval, disapproval, or abstention.

Ian Aiken Juan Arias-Acosta Ficheux Arnaud Peter Balma Thomas Barnes Steven Bezner Cameron Black Frank Blalock Anne Bosma Ted Burse Eldridge Byron Rachel Carbonell Arvind Chaudhary Robert Christman Randy Clelland Randall Crellin Jean-Bernard Dastous Huan Dinh Gary Donner Michael Dood Lonnie Elder Keith Ellis

Ryan Freeman Eric Fujisaki David Giegel Edwin Goodwin Randall Groves Ajit Gwal Kenneth Harless Steven Hensley Lee Herron Robert Hobbs Werner Hoelzl Daniel Huenger William Hurst Laszlo Kadar Leon Kempner Gael Kennedy Kamran Khan James Kinney Brian Knight Hermann Koch Jim Kulchisky Chung-Yiu Lam Albert Livshitz Benton Lott Otto Lynch Reginaldo Maniego Neil McCord Andrew McNulty Daleep Mohla Charles Morse Jeffrey Nelson Joe Nims Gearold O. H. Eidhin T. W. Olsen Lorraine Padden Iulian Profir Perumal Radhakrishnan Carl Reigart Michael Riley Charles Rogers Bartien Sayogo Dennis Schlender Nikunj Shah Michael Sharp

VI Convright @ 2010 IEEE All rights reserve Hyeong Sim Douglas Smith Jeremy Smith Fabian Stacy K. Stump James Taylor David Tepen John Toth James Van De Ligt John Vergis Achim von Seck Eric Weatherbee John Webb Kenneth White Shibao Zhang Yaowu Zhang Xi Zhu

When the IEEE-SA Standards Board approved this recommended practice on 23 October 2018, it had the following membership:

Jean-Philippe Faure, Chair Gary Hoffman, Vice Chair John Kulick, Past Chair Konstantinos Karachalios, Secretary

Ted Burse Guido Hiertz Christel Hunter Thomas Koshy Joseph L. Koepfinger\* Hung Ling

\*Member Emeritus

Dong Liu Xiaohui Liu Daleep Mohla Andrew Myles Paul Nikolich Annette D. Reilly Robby Robson Dorothy Stanley Mehmet Ulema Phil Wennblom Philip Winston Howard Wolfman Jingyi Zhou

## Introduction

This introduction is not part of IEEE Std 693-2018, IEEE Recommended Practice for Seismic Design of Substations.

This revision of IEEE Std 693-2005 was developed as a recommended practice for the seismic design of substations. This recommended practice emphasizes the seismic qualification of electrical equipment. Nuclear Class 1E equipment is not covered by this recommended practice, but it is covered by IEEE Std 344<sup>TM</sup>.

This recommended practice is intended to establish standard methods of providing and validating seismic withstand capability of electrical substation equipment. It provides detailed test and analysis methods for selected common equipment types of major equipment or components found in electrical substations.

This recommended practice is intended to assist the substation user or operator in providing substation equipment that will have a high probability of withstanding seismic events to predefined ground acceleration levels. It establishes standard methods of verifying seismic withstand capability. This gives the substation designer the ability to select equipment from various manufacturers, knowing that the seismic withstand rating of each manufacturer's equipment is an equivalent measure.

This recommended practice is also intended to guide the manufacturers of power equipment in the seismic design and in demonstrating and documenting the seismic withstand capability of their product in a form that can be universally accepted.

Although most damaging seismic activity occurs in limited areas, many additional areas could experience an earthquake with forces capable of causing great damage. This recommended practice should be used in all areas that may experience earthquakes.

This revision of the recommended practice incorporates a number of substantive as well as editorial changes from the previous version. The most significant of these changes include the following:

- Shake-table test requirements for qualification of bushings have been modified;
- Conductor seismic loading effects are explicitly included as part of the qualification of certain equipment;
- Time history shake-table testing at the Performance Level is required for most equipment that are required to be qualified by the time history test method;
- Seismic loads for the design of anchorages of inherently acceptable equipment have been increased.

It is the hope of those who worked on the development of this recommended practice that these standard methods of verifying seismic withstand capability will lead to better earthquake performance and to lower qualification costs.

VIII iabt © 2010 IEEE All ri

# Contents

1. Overview	15
1.1 Scope	15
1.2 Purpose	15
1.3 General	15
1.4 Associated design references	
1.5 Substation seismic design flow chart	
1.6 Earthquakes and substations	19
1.7 Design/construction and quality assurance processes	19
2. Normative references	19
3. Definitions, acronyms, and abbreviations	22
3.1 Definitions	22
3.2 Abbreviations and acronyms	25
4. Instructions	27
4.1 Format of this recommended practice	
4.2 Standardization of criteria.	
4.3 Specifying this recommended practice in user's specifications	27
4.4 Selection of qualification level for a region	
4.5 Acceptance of previously qualified electrical equipment	
4.6 Optional qualification methods	29
4.7 Qualifying equipment by group	
4.8 Inherently acceptable equipment	
4.9 Shake-table facilities	
4.10 Witnessing of shake-table testing	
4.11 Equipment too large to be tested in its in service configuration	
4.12 Table extension frame	
4.13 Low-frequency testing	
4.14 Report templates	34
5. Seismic criteria for qualification of electrical substation equipment	
5.1 General introduction	
5.2 Seismic qualification objective	
5.3 Seismic qualification approaches	
5.4 Seismic qualification methods with respect to test qualifications	
5.5 Seismic qualification methods with respect to analytical qualification	
5.6 Damping with respect to seismic qualification methods	
5.7 Seismic qualification levels	
5.8 Response spectra	
5.9 Discussion of other seismic design criteria	
<ul><li>5.10 Influence of support structures on seismic response of equipment</li><li>5.11 Qualification of equipment mounted within a building</li></ul>	
5.12 Selecting the seismic level for seismic qualification	
6. Design for site conditions and installation considerations	51
6.1 General	51
6.2 Equipment assembly	
6.3 Anchorage	
6.4 Site response local topography, near-field effects, and subduction zone earthquakes	
6.5 Soil-structure interaction	55